### UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN SOUTHERN DIVISION

Elnora Carthan; Rhonda Kelso, individually and as next friend of K.E.K. a minor; Darrell and Barbara Davis; Michael Snyder, as personal representative of the Estate of John Snyder, deceased; Marilyn Bryson; David Munzo; Tiantha Williams, individually and as next of friend of T.W., a minor child; Amber Brown, as next of friend of K.L.D., a minor child; Frances Gilcreast; EPCO Sales, LLC; Angelo's Coney Island Palace, Inc., on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs.

v

Governor Rick Snyder, in his individual and official capacities; the State of Michigan; the City of Flint; Daniel Wyant, in his individual capacity; Andy Dillion, in his individual capacity; Nick Lyon in his individual capacity; Nancy Peeler, in her individual capacity; Liane Shekter-Smith, in her individual capacity; Adam Rosenthal, in his individual capacity; Stephen Busch, in his individual capacity; Patrick Cook, in his individual capacity; Michael Prysby, in his individual capacity; Bradley Wurfel, in his individual capacity; Jeff Wright, in his individual capacity; Edward Kurtz, in his individual capacity; Darnell Earley, in his individual capacity; Gerald Ambrose, in his individual capacity; Dayne Walling, in his individual and official capacities; Howard Croft, in his individual; Michael Glasgow, in his individual capacity; Daugherty Johnson, in his individual capacity; Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, P.C.; Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.; Leo A. Daly Company; Veolia North America, LLC; Veolia North America, Inc.; Veolia Water North America Operating Services, LLC,

Defendants.

Case No.: 5:16-cv-10444-JEL-MKM

Hon. Judith E. Levy Magistrate Judge Mona K. Majzoub

# ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COMPANY'S ANSWER TO CONSOLIDATED AMENDED CLASS COMPLAINT FOR INJUNCTIVE AND DECLARATORY RELIEF, MONEY DAMAGES AND JURY DEMAND

NOW COMES Defendant, **ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COMPANY** ("ROWE"), by and through its attorneys, SULLIVAN, WARD, ASHER & PATTON, P.C., and in answer to the Consolidated Amended Complaint ("Complaint"), states as follows:

#### **INTRODUCTORY STATEMENT**

- 1. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 2. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### SUMMARY OF THE ENGINEERING DEFENDANTS' MISCONDUCT

- i. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- ii. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## SUMMARY OF THE CONSTITUTIONAL AND CIVIL RIGHTS VIOLATIONS AND INJURIES CAUSED BY THE GOVERNMENTAL DEFENDANTS

- iii. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- iv. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- v. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- vi. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- vii. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- viii. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- ix. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### **JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

- 4. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 5. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 6. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 7. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 8. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 9. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### **PARTIES**

#### A. Plaintiffs

- 11. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 12. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 13. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 14. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 15. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 16. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 17. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 18. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 19. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 20. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 21. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 22. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 23. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 24. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 25. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 26. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 27. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 28. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 29. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 30. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 31. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 32. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 33. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 34. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 35. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### **B.** Engineering Defendants

- 36. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 37. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 38. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 39. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 40. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 41. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 42. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 43. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 44. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 45. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 46. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 47. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 48. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 49. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 50. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 51. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 52. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 53. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 54. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 55. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 56. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### **C.** Government Defendants

- 57. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 58. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 59. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 60. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 61. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 62. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 63. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 64. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 65. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 66. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 67. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 68. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 69. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 70. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 71. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 72. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 73. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 74. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 75. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 76. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 77. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 78. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 79. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### **STATEMENT OF FACTS**

81. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### A. <u>Dangers From the Flint River Water Have Been Well-Known for Decades</u>

- 82. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 83. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 84. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 85. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 86(a-c). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 86(d). Rowe denies the allegations contained in this paragraph as they do not accurately reflect the facts and circumstances surrounding the 2011 study, although Rowe does generally admit that the study was commissioned by Genesee County and was intended to evaluate whether the Flint River would be a suitable permanent water supply source to the City of Flint.
- 86(e). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 87. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# B. <u>Despite These Well-Known Dangers, Defendants Decided to Use Flint River</u> Water as the Primary Water Source for the City of Flint

- 88. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 89. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 90. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 91. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 92. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 93. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 94. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 95. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 96. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 97. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 98. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 99. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 100. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 101. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 102. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 103. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 104. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 105. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 106. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 107. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 108. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 109. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 110. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 111. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 112. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 113. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 114. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# C. <u>The LAN Defendants Failed to Meet Their Duties of Care and Competence</u> as Design Engineers for the Flint Water Treatment Plant

- 115. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 116. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 117(a-b). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 118. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 119. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 120(a-f). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 121(a-f). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 122. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 123. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 124. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 125. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 126. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 127. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 128. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 129. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 130. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# D. <u>Numerous Signs of the Public Health Crisis Caused By the Contaminated</u> Water Were Evident Within Weeks of the Switch

- 131. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 132. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 133. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 134. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 135. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 136. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 137. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 138. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 139. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 140. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 141. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 142. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 143. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 144. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 145. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 146. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 147. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 148. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 149. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 150. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 151. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 152. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 153. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 154. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# E. <u>The LAN and Veolia Defendants Were Asked to Evaluate the Problems, But</u> <u>Failed to Do So Properly</u>

- 155. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 156. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 157. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 158(a-c). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 159(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 160. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 161. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 162. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 163. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 164. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 165. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 166. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 167. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 168. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 169. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 170. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 171. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 172. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 173. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 174. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 175. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### F. The LAN and Veolia Defendants Fail to Conduct a Root Cause Analysis

- 176. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 177. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 178. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 179. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 180. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 181. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 182. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### G. The LAN and Veolia Defendants' Conclusions Made the Crisis Worse

- 184. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 185. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 186. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 187. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 188. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 189. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 190. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 191. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 192. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 193. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 194. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 195. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 196. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 197. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 198. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 199. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### H. <u>Despite the Numerous Signs of the Growing Crisis, the Government</u> Defendants Failed to Act, and Concealed Known Dangers From the Plaintiffs

- 200. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 201. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 202. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 203. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 204. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 205. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 206. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 207. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 208. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 209. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 210. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 211. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 212. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 213. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 214. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 215. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 216. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 217. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 218. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 219. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 220(a-c). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 221. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 222. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 223. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 224. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 225. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 226. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 227. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 228. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 229. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 230. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 231. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 232. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 233(1-4). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 234. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 235. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 236. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 237. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 238. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 239. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 240. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 241. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 242. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 243. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 244. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 245. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 246. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 247. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 248. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 249. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 250. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 251. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 252. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 254(a-b). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 255. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 256. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 257. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 258. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 259. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 260. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 261. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 262. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## I. <u>Defendants' Misconduct Has Caused the Plaintiffs to Suffer Devastating Health Effects and Other Personal Injuries</u>

- 263. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 264. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 265. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 266. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 267. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 268. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 269. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 270. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 271. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 272. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 273. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 274. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 275. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 276. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 277. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 278. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## J. <u>Defendants; Misconduct Has Also Caused the Plaintiffs to Suffer Extensive Property Damage and Monetary Losses.</u>

- 279. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 280. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 281. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 282. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 283. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 284. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 285. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 286. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 287. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 288. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 289. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 290. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 291. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 292. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 293. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 294. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 295. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 296. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 297. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 298. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 299. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 300. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 301. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 302. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 303. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 304. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## K. <u>Defendants' Misconduct Has Resulted in Criminal Indictments and Other Government Investigations</u>

- 305. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 306. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### L. Efforts to Remediate the Harms Alleged Herein Are Inadequate.

- 307. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 308. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 309. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

#### **CLASS ALLEGATIONS**

- 311. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 312. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 313. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 314. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 315. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 316. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 317. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 318. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 319. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# COUNT I – CAUSE OF ACTION 42 U.S.C. §1983 – 14<sup>TH</sup> AMENDMENT SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS – STATE CREATED DANGER: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST GOVERNMENT DEFENDANTS

- 320. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 319 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 321. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 322. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 323. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 324. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 325. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 326. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 327. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 329. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 329(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 330. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# COUNT II – CAUSE OF ACTION 42 U.S.C. § 1983 – 14<sup>TH</sup> AMENDMENT SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS – BODILY INTEGRITY: BY INDIVIDUAL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST GOVERNMENT DEFENDANTS

- 331. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 330 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 332. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 333. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 334. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 335. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 336. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 337(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# COUNT III – CAUSE OF ACTION 42 U.S.C. § 1983 – 5<sup>TH</sup> AND 14<sup>TH</sup> AMENDMENTS EQUAL PROTECTION OF THE LAW: RACE-BASED: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST SNYDER, DILLON, WRIGHT, WALLING, AMBROSE, KURTZ & EARLEY

- 339. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 338 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 340. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 341. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 342. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 343. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 344. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 345. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 346. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 347. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 348. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 349. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 350. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 351. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

354(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

355. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# COUNT IV – CAUSE OF ACTION 42 U.S.C. § 1983 – 5<sup>TH</sup> AND 14<sup>TH</sup> AMENDMENTS EQUAL PROTECTION OF THE LAW: WEALTH-BASED: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST SNYDER, DILLON, WRIGHT, WALLING, AMBROSE, KURTZ & EARLEY

- 356. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 355 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 357. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 358. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 359. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 360. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 361. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 362. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 363. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 364. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 365. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 366. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 367. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 368. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 369. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 370(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 371. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# COUNT V – CAUSE OF ACTION 42 U.S.C. § 1985(3) INVIDIOUS RACIAL ANIMUS: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST SNYDER, DILLON, WRIGHT, WALLING, AMBROSE, KURTZ & EARLEY

- 372. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 371 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 373. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 374. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 375. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 376. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 377. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 378. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 379. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 380. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 381. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 382. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 383. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 384. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 386(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 387. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

# COUNT VI – CAUSE OF ACTION MCL 37.2302 – VIOLATION OF PUBLIC SERVICE PROVISIONS OF ELCRA-DISPARATE TREATMENT AND DISPARATE IMPACT PLAINTIFFS AGAINST SNYDER, STATE OF MICHIGAN, DILLON, WRIGHT, WALLING, AMBROSE, KURTZ, EARLEY, AND THE CITY OF FLINT

388. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 387 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.

- 389. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 390. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 391. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 392. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 393. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 394. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 395. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 396. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 397. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 398. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 399. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 400. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 401. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 402. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 403(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 404. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### <u>COUNT VII – CAUSE OF ACTION</u> MONELL CLAIM: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST THE CITY OF FLINT

- 405 (a-d)(i-v). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 406. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 407. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 408. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 409(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## COUNT VIII - CAUSE OF ACTION PROFESSIONAL NEGLIGENCE: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST LAN PC, LAN INC. & LAD

- 411. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 410 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 412. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 413. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 414. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 415. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 416. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 417. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 418. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 419. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 420. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 421. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 422. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 423. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 424. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 425. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 426. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 427(a-c). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 428. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 429. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 430. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 431(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 432. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## COUNT IX – CAUSE OF ACTION PROFESSIONAL NEGLIGENCE: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST THE VEOLIA DEFENDANTS

- 433. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 432 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 434. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 435. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 436. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 437. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 438. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 439. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 440. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 441. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 442. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 443. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 444. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 445. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 446. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 447. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 448. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 449. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 450. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 451(a-c). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

- 452. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 453. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 454. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 455(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 456. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 457. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### COUNT X – CAUSE OF ACTION FRAUD: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST THE VEOLIA DEFENDANTS

458. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 457 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.

- 459. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 460(a-c). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 461. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 462. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 463. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 464(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## COUNT XI – CAUSE OF ACTION NEGLIGENT INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS: BY INDIVIDUAL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST ENGINEERING DEFENDANTS

465. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 464 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.

- 466. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 467. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

### COUNT XI – CAUSE OF ACTION NEGLIGENCE: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST ENGINEERING DEFENDANTS

- 468. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 467 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 469. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 470. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 471. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.
- 472. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

474. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

475. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

476. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

477(a-b, a-b). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

## COUNT XII – CAUSE OF ACTION GROSS NEGLIGENCE: BY ALL PLAINTIFFS AGAINST THE ENGINEERING DEFENDANTS

- 478. Defendant Rowe herein repeats each and every answer contained in Paragraphs 1 through 477 of Plaintiffs' Consolidated Amended Class Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 479. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to their proofs.

480. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for

lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to

their proofs.

481. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for

lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to

their proofs.

482. Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for

lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to

their proofs.

483(a-d). Defendant Rowe neither admits nor denies the allegations in this paragraph for

lack of sufficient information or knowledge upon which to form a belief, and leaves Plaintiffs to

their proofs.

WHEREFORE, Defendant ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES **COMPANY** 

respectfully requests that this Honorable Court enters a judgment of no cause for action in its

favor and awards it all reasonable costs and attorney fees incurred in defense of this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

SULLIVAN, WARD, **ASHER & PATTON, P.C.** 

/s/ Craig S. Thompson

Sullivan, Ward, Asher & Patton, P.C. 25800 Northwestern Highway

Southfield, MI 48075

248.746.0700

E-Mail: cthompson@swappc.com

Bar No.: P48839

Dated: December 1, 2017

71

### DEFENDANT ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COMPANY'S <u>AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES</u>

NOW COMES Defendant **ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COMPANY** ("ROWE"), by and through its attorneys, SULLIVAN, WARD, ASHER & PATTON, P.C., and for its Affirmative Defenses, states as follows:

- 1. The Consolidated Amended Class Complaint fails in whole or in part to state any claim against Defendant ROWE.
- 2. The Consolidated Amended Class Complaint fails in whole or in part to state legally viable claims upon which relief can be granted.
- 3. Plaintiffs' claims are barred by a prior judgment in <u>Guertin</u> v. <u>State of Michigan</u>, et al., Eastern District Case No. 16-cv-12412 [ECF No. 151].
  - 4. The proposed classes of Plaintiffs are legally impermissible.
- 5. At all times relevant herein, the actions of Defendant ROWE were reasonable and proper, and met or exceeded the applicable standard of care.
- 6. Defendant ROWE relies upon its rights, obligations and defenses as set forth in the contract(s) between and amongst the parties.
- 7. Defendant ROWE did not owe any duty to Plaintiffs separate and distinct from its contractual obligations.
- 8. The damages Plaintiffs' allegedly sustained were not proximately caused by any acts of Defendant ROWE, but rather were proximately caused in total or in part as a result of the negligence, breach of contract or other culpable conduct of parties (including potential non-parties) other than Defendant ROWE.
- 9. Defendant ROWE is entitled to an apportionment of damages in relation to the degree of all parties, persons, whether joined as companies or entities, Co-Defendant or not.

10. Defendant ROWE is entitled to a set-off from any recovery against it to the extent

of any and all benefits paid or payable to or on behalf of Plaintiffs from any and all collateral

sources to the extent such a set-off is permissible under the laws applicable to this cause of

action.

11. Defendant ROWE reserves the right to bring a motion for summary judgment as

provided under Fed. R. Civ. P. 56 and the grounds set forth therein.

12. Plaintiffs failed to mitigate their damages and/or were negligent in their

mitigation of same.

13. Defendant ROWE hereby incorporates the affirmative defenses asserted by other

parties.

14. Defendant ROWE reserves the right to add further Affirmative Defenses as may

be necessary throughout the course of discovery.

Respectfully submitted,

SULLIVAN, WARD,

ASHER & PATTON, P.C.

/s/ Craig S. Thompson

Sullivan, Ward, Asher & Patton, P.C. 25800 Northwestern Highway Southfield, MI 48075

248.746.0700

E-Mail: cthompson@swappc.com

Bar No.: P48839

Dated: December 1, 2017

73

<u>DEFENDANT ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COMPANY'S</u>
<u>RELIANCE ON JURY DEMAND</u>

NOW COMES Defendant, **ROWE PROFESSIONAL SERVICES COMPANY'S** ("ROWE"), by and through its attorneys, SULLIVAN, WARD, ASHER & PATTON, P.C., and

hereby relies upon the Jury Demand as to the issues of this cause of action.

Respectfully submitted,

SULLIVAN, WARD, ASHER & PATTON, P.C.

/s/ Craig S. Thompson

Sullivan, Ward, Asher & Patton, P.C. 25800 Northwestern Highway Southfield, MI 48075

248.746.0700

E-Mail: <a href="mailto:cthompson@swappc.com">cthompson@swappc.com</a>

Bar No.: P48839

Dated: December 1, 2017

**PROOF OF SERVICE** 

I hereby certify that on December 1, 2017, I caused to be electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF System, which will send notification to the ECF counsel of record.

/s/ Craig S. Thompson

Sullivan, Ward, Asher & Patton, P.C. 25800 Northwestern Highway Southfield, MI 48075

248.746.0700

E-Mail: cthompson@swappc.com

Bar No.: P48839

W2070034

74